

## Minutes of the Eighth Meeting of National Steering Committee on REDD+

Eighth meeting of the National Steering Committee (NSC) on REDD+ was convened on June 13, 2018 in the Committee Room of Ministry of Climate Change under the Chairmanship of the Additional Secretary, Ministry of Climate Change. The Chair welcomed all members in particular provincial REDD Focal Persons, foreign experts and participants from the provinces who travelled long distances to attend this important meeting. The list of participants is attached as Annex 1.

### AGENDA ITEM 1: REVIEW OF PROGRESS OF IMPLEMENTATION ON DECISIONS OF SEVENTH MEETING OF NSC ON REDD+.

Dr. Ghulam Akbar, the National REDD+ Coordinator (NRC), briefed about the progress made on decisions taken during seventh NSC meeting held on 9<sup>th</sup> April 2018. Copy of his power point presentation is at Annex II and precise implementation status is given below:

S. No.	Decision of the 7 <sup>th</sup> NSC	Status of Implementation
1.	All consultants shall ensure quality of deliverables as per Terms of References (TOR).	Conveyed to all Consulting Firms. Representatives of all consulting firms present in the meeting shall update on their respective positions. Arbonaut due to cogent reasons is behind schedule, and has requested an extension of three months.
2.	All provincial focal points shall share progress reports with relevant stakeholders.	Conveyed to all provincial focal points who are present in the 8 <sup>th</sup> NSC meeting
3.	The Chair showed serious concerns on the progress of Indufor and CHIP Training & Consulting (CTC) for developing National REDD+ Strategy.	Indufor furnished the revised progress and made attempt to rectify the mistakes again. The firm has submitted Draft Final Report that has been forwarded to the NPD by the National REDD Coordinator (NRC). The Final Report has also been submitted to the NRC that has yet to be forwarded to the NPD. The Draft Final Report has been vetted and approved by the Technical Committee headed by the NRC. The NPD / IGF having serious concerns had therefore requested the Chair of NSC to consider the approval of the draft Final Report. Experts of Indufor and CHIP shall give presentation to the 8 <sup>th</sup> meeting of NSC.
4.	The Chair directed the NRC to stop their further payments until they fulfill the contractual obligations in letter and spirit. He further desired that a separate case of this contract may be submitted to him.	Detailed case submitted to the Chair as explained in Sr. No. 3 above on the basis of which the current meeting of NSC has been convened.

5.	The consultants (Indufor and CTC) to submit explanation for missing relevant stakeholders.	Consultants were conveyed concerns of the NSC. <i>but</i> no reply <del>had been</del> received before this meeting. Mr. Tayyab representing the consulting consortium explained that stakeholders had been included in the latest draft Final Report.
6.	The data and the registry will be housed in the Global Change Impact Studies Center (GCISC), Ministry of Climate Change after expiry of the project.	Compliance has been made and GCISC is in the process of taking over the data and hardware from the National REDD Office (NRO). In future GCISC shall host all forest GHG data generated by this project.
7.	The GCISC should also be included as a member of the NSC of the R-PP.	Compliance made. <sup>7</sup> GCISC has nominated Mr. Arif Goheer, Principal Scientific Officer (PSO) as a regular member of the NSC.
8.	The Web Portal will be linked with the website of National REDD+ Office. i.e. <a href="http://www.redd-pakistan.org">www.redd-pakistan.org</a>	Being implemented by Arbonaut and it will submit along with Final Report.
9.	It was decided that the Safeguard Information System SIS website will be linked with National REDD+ Office's website till the final decision on hosting the data at national level is made.	Being implemented. All web portals will be linked with National REDD Office website.
10.	Pakistan Forest Institute PFI will develop the resource material as per contract simultaneously with the design of payment for environmental services.	Decision conveyed and resource material developed by PFI which is under review by NRO.

*21/6*

**AGENDA ITEM 2: UP-TO-DATE PROGRESS OF REDD+ READINESS PREPARATION GRANT OF FCPF.**

Inspector General Forests (IGF) in his opening remarks stated that he attended the day long workshop held on 12<sup>th</sup> June, 2018 wherein all firms except Indufor presented their findings to the provincial focal persons and stakeholders. He summarized his impressions and the progress of the five studies that were awarded by the NRO after approval of the World Bank in accordance with the Grant Agreement to various national and international consulting Firms. He appreciated the gesture of the international firms CLP and Arbonaut who had sponsored study tours of provincial officers abroad in addition to their contractual obligations, the summary of the progress is given below:

1. Consultancy titled "Development of the National REDD+ Strategy and its Implementation Framework" was awarded to M/S Indufor Oy in Association with CTC (sub-consultant) effective from December 15, 2016 to March 31, 2018. There were serious mistakes and errors in the Reports furnished by the consultant who had agreed to rectify the same and even change some of the experts were still found unsatisfactory by

*1*

the NPD. Moreover the consultant could not give a presentation in the 7<sup>th</sup> NSC meeting held on 9th April 2018.

The Procurement Specialist informed that two extensions of the contract period as requested by the Consultant were extended by the Bank to May 31, 2018. NPD continued that despite continuous guidance, M/S Indufor is repeatedly presenting reports with serious mistakes; and that they had in previous reports passed the Technical committee scrutiny but subsequently defects were pointed out by NPD which they corrected subsequently. IGF also stated that neither he nor the NRO is the thesis supervisor of Indufor, had they spent money and hired quality consultants from the market this report full of mistakes would not have been presented to the NPD. He added that in particular they failed to comply with decisions taken in the 6<sup>th</sup> and 7<sup>th</sup> meeting of the NSC for including real forest owners from various forest ecosystems in the consultations.

Dr. Ghulam Akbar NRO stated that Indufor has now worked very hard and resubmitted the latest Draft Final Report which has been approved by the Technical Committee headed by him. The NPD however pointed out serious lacunae in the Draft Final Report and stated that a defective Strategy will always bring bad name to the Project. Mr. Irteza Qureshi and Mr. Niaz Kakar focal persons of AJK and Baluchistan respectively appreciated the work done by Indufor and expressed satisfaction on the work done and supported that their Draft Final Report must be approved and payment released. The IGF opined that reports of consultations do not serve any purpose in the Strategy unless the same are analyzed by the global experts in light of UNFCCC decisions and provincial/national policies and laws. IGF further added that a defective strategy will always be a bottleneck in accessing global carbon finance and that compilation of technician level reports cannot be termed as Strategy. The IGF further shared the list of his observations on the Report and stated that there is no connection between the various sections of the Strategy. He added that unless drastic improvements are made he will not individually share the responsibility of its approval; though the Technical Committee headed by NRC has approved the Report and recommended release of payments. IGF/NPD explained that this special NSC has been convened after approval of the Chair NSC.

2. Consultancy titled "Develop Forest Reference Emission Levels/Forest Reference Level and National Forest Monitoring System (NFMS)-Measurement and Reporting and Verification (MRV) System for REDD+" was awarded to Joint Venture of M/S Oy Arbonaut (Lead Consultant) with WWF – Pakistan effective from October 13, 2016 to June 18, 2018. The NRO mentioned that extensive work has been undertaken under this study as was evident by their workshop held on June 12, 2018 at Islamabad. He mentioned that having vast scope of the study, M/S Arbonaut has requested for extension due to delays in getting NOCs from the Survey of Pakistan and clearance from Ministry of Interior for travel authorization of foreign experts. He stated that they had requested extension of another 90 days i.e., up to September 30, 2018 with an additional cost of US \$ 55,998. He mentioned that in principle, we support their request subject to approval of the World Bank. The IGF agreeing with the NRC pointed out that currently total forest area of Pakistan is being reported as 5.01% while the Arbonaut has reported 4.34% which needs to be verified carefully by

W  
21/6  


all provinces. The NRO emphasized that the results have been shared with the provinces/territories, which should be validated by them and that subsequently endorsement certificates shall also be obtained from them. The IGF also pointed out that statistical calculation for calculating sample sizes and criteria used for selection of sample plots should be clearly highlighted by Arbonaut. Mr. Joshi Representative of Arbonaut replied that all this information is available in the report and shall be further elaborated in the final report

3. Consultancy titled “Preparing a Feedback and Grievance Redressal Mechanisms (FGRM) for REDD+ after an Explicit Assessment of Existing FGRM & Developing Safeguards Information System (SIS) and Social and Environmental Management Framework (ESMF) through Strategic Environmental and Social Assessment (SESA)” was awarded to Climate Law & Policy – UK (CLP) in Association with Hagler Bailly, Pakistan effective from July 18, 2017 to May 17, 2018. IGF appreciated the good work undertaken by CLP, NRO further informed that all the reports from CLP have been received in time after addressing comments of the NRC and NPD.
4. Consultancy titled “REDD+ Awareness & Outreach” being an important component was awarded to Sustainable Policy Development Institute (SDPI), Islamabad from February 16, 2017 to May 15, 2018. IGF mentioned that by and large good work has been undertaken by SDPI as was evident from the participants of the workshop of June 12, 2018 whereby SDPI presented its progress. However, IGF recommended that SDPI should convene at least one more session with the parliamentarians. The NRC informed that he has reviewed the Draft Final Report furnished by SDPI and found it of good quality. Mr/ 21/6
5. Consultancy titled “Designing of REDD+ Payments for Environmental Services” was awarded to Pakistan Forest Institute (PFI), Peshawar effective from January 16, 2018 to June, 23, 2018. Good work has been undertaken by PFI by engaging consultants of international repute and expertise in the face of limited time. IGF informed that he himself attended the validation workshop of PFI on June 12, 2018 and appreciated the economic valuation of forest ecosystem services done by PFI. He stated that he looks forward to receiving the report of the technical Committee and that PFI needs to find means to disseminate the findings of the study in particular to the real forest stakeholders and society at large.

After the introductory remarks and overview the NRC presented the status of the assignments undertaken by the consulting firms, as under;

S. No.	Name of Study & Consulting Firm	Status of Deliverables	Remaining Work.
1.	Development of the National REDD+ Strategy and its Implementation Framework.	Inception Report, Interim Report and Mid-term Report received and approved and payments made.	Draft Final Report and Final Report and their corresponding payments still pending.

2.	Develop FREL/FRL and NFMS-MRV System for REDD+	Inception Report, Interim Report and Mid-term Report received and were approved and their payments made.	Draft Final Report and Final Report and their corresponding payments still pending. The firm has requested for three months extension with additional finances of US \$ 55,998.
3.	Preparing a FGRM for REDD+ after an Explicit Assessment of Existing FGRM & Developing SIS and ESMF through SESA	Inception Report, Interim Report and Mid-term Report received and approved and payments made. Final Report has also been received and is currently under review.	Approval for Draft Final Report and Final Report in process and their payments awaited.
4.	“REDD+ Awareness & Outreach	Inception Report, Interim Report, Mid-term Report and Draft Final Report received. Payments made for Inception Report, Interim Report and Mid-term Report.	Draft Final Report is under review and Final Report is awaited.
5.	Designing REDD+ PES for Two Selected Ecosystems of Pakistan”	Inception Report, Interim Report, Mid-term Report and Draft Final Report received. Approval and payments made for Inception Report and Interim Report.	Approval and payments for Mid-term Report and Draft Final Report in process. Final Report also awaited.

*21/6*

After presenting the status of the deliverables by the firms, the NRC put forth following recommendations to the house for approval;

- Draft Final Reports of Indufor, CLP and SDPI and Mid-tem report of PFI may be approved.
- An extension of three month up to 30th September, 2018 may be given to M/S Arbonaut/WWF-P for completion of their work as per contractual obligations and desired standard.
- PFI may accelerate progress of its assignment to ensure completion before 30<sup>th</sup> June 2018.

The Chair enquired if Indufor has requested for further extension. The Procurement specialist informed that two extensions have already been given whereas no request has been received from this firm for another extension. Mr. Jaime and Mr. Tayyab representing the consultant

*l*

committed that the points raised by the NPD have been well taken and noted and that they shall submit the Final Interim report by 25<sup>th</sup> June, 2018.

**AGENDA ITEM 3: APPROVAL OF DRAFT FINAL REPORT SUBMITTED BY INDUFOR & CTC FOR THE ASSIGNMENT “DEVELOPMENT OF THE NATIONAL REDD+ STRATEGY AND ITS IMPLEMENTATION FRAMEWORK FOR PAKISTAN”.**

Mr. Jaime Severino, Team Leader of Indufor before presenting the progress of the assignment showed a documentary prepared as part of the contractual deliverables. Upon display of the documentary, the Chair appreciated the efforts made by Indufor/CTC for preparation of the documentary and directed that copy right permissions may be added in the deliverable for the clips taken from other sources. IGF mentioned that this is developed on the no cost documentary available on the internet prepared by the late DIG of the Ministry, Dr. Shahzad Jehangir, Deputy Inspector General of Forests (DIGF), therefore, his efforts should be duly acknowledged.

Thereafter, Mr. Jaime presented the progress of the assignment (copy of power point presentation at Annex III) and highlighted that wide consultations with provincial REDD+ Management Committees, forest owners, right holders, communities, Guzara Committees, government and non-government entities were held. Based on the feedback of these stakeholders, drivers of deforestations, Strategic Interventions and Institutional Framework have been developed. He mentioned that Draft Final Report with all the required components was presented in the validation workshop held on May 15, 2018 at Islamabad where all the members of Thematic Working Groups, Provincial REDD+ Focal Points and other stakeholders such as academia, research institutes and members from SUPARCO and Survey of Pakistan were present. Stakeholders gave their comments and unanimously approved the Draft Final Report/Draft National REDD+ Strategy. He mentioned that all the comments given by the workshop participants especially from provinces were incorporated in the Draft Final Report and presented to the National REDD Office. At this point, Mr. Muhammad Siddique Khattak, the Chief Conservator of Forests, Khyber Pakhtunkhwa (KP) mentioned that dependence of local communities on forests due to fuel wood, timber, grazing and Non-timber Forest Products is missing in the list of drivers of deforestation. The Chair asked whether “Corruption” as a driver of deforestation has been taken up. Mr. Jaime, Indufor mentioned that corruption has been addressed under “governance”. The Chair also pointed out that it is mentioned in the document that the Council of Common Interest will have role in implementation of National REDD+ Strategy which is not correct. The Chair further enquired whether the forest owners from Darel Tangir, Murre Kahuta and mangrove forests were consulted. Mr. Muhammad Tayyab, Deputy Team Leader, CTC pointed out that forest owners from various parts of the country were consulted including the Darel & Tangeer valley of Gilgit-Baltistan and KP and their clips have also been included in the documentary. The Chair directed to include the contact details of all stakeholders in the Report.

21/6

The IGF while referring to a slide of the presentation which showed that line Ministries were consulted asked the list of the federal ministries and provincial departments like Mines, Planning, Finance, Agriculture etc. to be included in the Interim Report. Mr Tayyab agreed that

l

the full list of the Ministries consulted shall be included in the revised report to be submitted by June 25<sup>th</sup>.

The Chair also asked that under institutional arrangement, a National Management Committee (NMC) has been proposed while there is also a National Steering Committee. The NRC explained that this was included on the feedback of the provinces. He elaborated that the NMC includes all the Provincial REDD+ Focal Points under the Chairmanship of the IGF being National Focal Point on REDD+. The Chair directed that Indufor must include the composition and ToRs of the NMC in the appendix. The IGF remarked that Indufor repeatedly submits reports with serious mistakes on material facts and spellings that are not expected from a high profile international firm. The NRC suggested that Indufor must hire services of an English Editor for a final review of the document prior to submission to National REDD+ Office to avoid such mistakes time and time again. The Chair also directed that while submitting the final document, Indufor must present a certificate of due diligence certifying that they have fulfilled all provisions of the Procurement Guidelines of the World Bank.

IGF mentioned that analysis of drivers of deforestation is missing in the report and it must be included. He added that WWF-Pakistan also conducted such a study on drivers of deforestation but their work has not been referred in the report. At this point, Mr. Walayat Noor, Chief Conservator of Forests Gilgit-Baltistan mentioned that considerable work has been done by Indufor/CTC and that must be appreciated. He mentioned that the house may allow their payment for now while they will incorporate all the decisions of the NSC in their final report. On this point the Procurement Specialist pointed out that as per WB Guidelines and terms of the Contract the Draft Final Report must be fully approved before any payment could be processed and that no conditional payment is allowed as per Rules. Provincial Focal Points from Balochistan and Azad Jammu & Kashmir applauded the efforts of Indufor/CTC for their extended field work.

Abdul Baseer, Conservator of Forests, FATA, highlighted that area specific drivers of deforestation are missing in the report. He mentioned two important drivers of deforestation of FATA, which are 1) Security Personnel present on both sides of the international border between Pakistan and Afghanistan who chop down and 2) Absentee Landlords, the forests of which are being exploited by the local communities. He added that there seems to be no particular strategy proposed for addressing these two important drivers of FATA in the report. Mr. Tayyab, CTC, responded that Provincial REDD+ Strategy briefs have already been provided in the annexure of the report for addressing specific types of drivers related to each province/territory. He further added that consultations with FATA stakeholders could not be undertaken due to security reasons. To this the Conservator FATA pointed out that if Arbonaut experts could visit remote areas of FATA why not Indufor and that he cannot subscribe to a report where the stakeholders who are the sole owners of forests have been missed

The Chair further pointed out that there seems many errors in the report and it lacks logical sequence. He enquired whether the report was also shared with all the provinces. NRC mentioned that the report has been shared with the representatives of provinces in soft copies through USB flash drives. He added that the copies were also sent via email and it was also

*mw*  
*21/6*

*l*

reminded to the provinces time and time again that the reports can also be accessed from the official website of the National REDD+ Office. He also emphasized that the report has been endorsed by the representatives of the provinces in the 'Validation Workshop' which was held on May 15, 2018 in Islamabad. To this the NPD again asked the NRC and Indufor to ensure that hard copies are shared with the provincial secretaries and the line Ministries/ provincial departments consulted in preparation of the strategy immediately as digital correspondence is still not in vogue in the government offices.

IGF asked how the nomadic grazing mentioned in the presentation and other potential drivers of deforestation, have been catered for in the report. Team Leader, Indufor, responded that 'Silvopastoral Practices and Sustainable Grazing' have been proposed for this. To which, IGF mentioned that sustainable grazing is a vague term, therefore, it cannot be considered as a concrete solution to the nomadic grazing. The IGF state that in nutshell the strategy should clearly specify the drivers, incorporate the policies, laws and institutional arrangements and finally in light of international law in particular the UNFCCC give clearly how each driver is to be addressed. The cumulative impact of the remedial steps to address the drivers should give the bigger picture on how Pakistan is to address the drivers of deforestation.

#### **Decisions:**

- The Draft Final Report as committed by Indufor will be submitted by June 25, 2018, addressing all the errors and shortcomings highlighted in the NSC meeting.
- Subject to the approval of the report by the IGF, the payment for the Draft Final Report may be released to Indufor.
- Extension request if made by Indufor shall be subject to approval by the World Bank
- The comments provided by Dr. Raja Omer, DIGF, will also be incorporated in the report.
- The hard copies of the refined version of the Draft Final Report for all consultancies will also be shared with the Provincial Secretaries of the respective Provinces/Territories by NRO and all their comments must invariably be addressed.
- Indufor/CTC and NRO should submit certificates to the effect that due diligence as provided in the Bank Procurement Guidelines have fully been fulfilled.
- The sources used in the documentary will be duly acknowledged with written permission of the copyright owners' use of their clips by Indufor including reference to the similar no cost documentary prepared by late DIG Forest.
- Arbonaut will share their final results with provinces/territories and will obtain endorsement certificates.
- Arbonaut will provide clarification regarding statistical calculations and criteria adopted for determining and selection of sample sizes in their report.
- NSC endorses the extension requested by the Arbonaut.
- SDPI may convene one more session with the parliamentarians.

*WJ/b*  
21/6



- NRC to ensure that CLP and PFI have addressed all comments of provinces and stakeholders .

The meeting ended with and from thanks to the Chair. The house also approved the Mid-term Report of PFI, Draft Final Report of CLP and Draft Final Report of SDPI.

*lw*  
2/16.

|